BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 03328 4696

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY IN CANADA
(Cases and Materials)

Volume 1

Prepared By

Gary T. Trotter

Spring Term - 1996

Storage

KF
9685
T76
1996
v.1
c.1

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 15 1996

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY IN CANADA
(Cases and Materials)

Volume 1

Prepared By

Gary T. Trotter

Spring Term - 1996

Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/sentencingpenalp01trot

SENTENCING AND PENAL POLICY IN CANADA
(Cases and Materials)

Vol. 1

Table of Contents

CHAPTER 1 - THE PHILOSOPHICAL DIMENSIONS OF SENTENCING 1

(a) Introduction: Framing the Debate 1

David Garland, Punishment and Modern Society: A Study in Social Theory (1990) 3

R.A. Duff, Trials and Punishments (1986) 6

H.L.A. Hart, "Prolegomenon to the Principles of Punishment", in Punishment and Responsibility: Essays in the Philosphy of Law (1968) 10

(b) Utilitarian Theories of Punishment 18

C.L. Ten, Crime, Guilt and Punishment (1987) 20

C.S. Lewis, The Humanitarian Theory of Punishment (1953) 6 *Res Judicatae* 224 29

Andrew von Hirsch, Past or Future Crimes - Deservedness and Dangerousness in the Sentencing of Criminals (1985) 34

(c) Retributive Theories of Punishment 39

J. Braitwaite and P. Pettit, Not Just Deserts: A Republican Theory of Criminal Justice (1990) 39

C.L. Ten Crime, Guilt and Punishment (1987) 44

Andrew von Hirsch, "Proportionality in the

Philosophy of Punishment", in M. Tonry (ed.), Crime and Justice - A Review of Research, XVI (1992) 56

Michael Tonry, "Proportionality, Parimony, and Interchangeability of Punishments", in Penal Theory and Practice (1994) 61

(d) Transcending the Philosophical Debate 65

David Garland, Punishment and Modern Society: A Study in Social Theory (1990) 65

CHAPTER 2 - THE JUDICIAL AIMS AND METHODOLOGY OF SENTENCING 73

Regina v. Willaert (1953), 105 C.C.C. 172 (Ont. C.A.) 74

Regina v. Wilmott, [1967] 1 C.C.C. 172 (Ont. C.A.) 76

Regina v. Preston (1990), 79 C.R. (3d) 61 (B.C.C.A.) 83

Regina v. Sweeney (1992), 11 C.R. (4th) 1 (B.C.C.A.) 88

Regina v. M. (C.A.) (1994), 28 C.R. (4th) 106 (B.C.C.A.) 97

David Cole & Allan Manson, Release From Imprisonment: The Law of Sentencing, Parole and Judicial Review (1990) 101

Regina v. Johnas et al. (1982), 32 C.R. (3d) 1 (Alta. C.A.) 102

Regina v. Sandercock (1985), 22 C.C.C. (3d) 79 (Alta. C.A.) 108

Note on "Starting-Point" Cases 114

Regina v. Joseph B. (1990), 36 O.A.C. 307 (C.A.) 114

Note on Bill C-41 117

An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (Sentencing) and Consequential Amendments (Bill C-41) 118

CHAPTER 3 - FACTORS IN AGGRAVATION AND MITIGATION OF SENTENCE 120

Nigel Walker, Sentencing: Theory, Law and Practice 120

Regina v. Gordon M. (1993), 11 O.R. (3d) 225 (Ont. C.A.) 128

CHAPTER 4 - PROCEDURAL AND EVIDENTIARY ASPECTS OF SENTENCING 132

(a) The Factual Basis of Sentencing: The Question of Proof 132

Regina v. Gardiner (1982), 30 C.R. (3d) 289 (S.C.C.) 133

Regina v. Poorman (1991), 6 C.R. (4th) 364 (Sask. C.A.) 138

Regina v. Brown (1991), 6 C.R. (4th) 334 (S.C.C.) 143

Regina v. Lawrence (1987), 58 C.R. (3d) 71 (Ont. H.C.) 146

R.J. Delisle, Annotation to Regina v. Lawerence (1987), 58 C.R. (3d) 71 (Ont. H.C.) 149

(b) Sources of Information Relating to the Offender 150

(i) The Right to Speak to Sentence: s.668 150

Regina v. Schofield (1976), 36 C.R.N.S. 135 (N.S.C.A.) 150

Regina v. Dennison (1990), 80 C.R. (3d) 78 (N.B.C.A.) 152

(ii) Pre-Sentence Reports: s.735 155

Regina v. Dolbec, [1963] 2 C.C.C. 87 (B.C.C.A.) 156

Regina v. Rudyk (1975), 1 C.R. (3d) S-26 (N.B.C.A.) 159

Regina v. Arsenault (1981), 21 C.R. (3d) 269 (P.E.I. S.C.) 163

Regina v. Urbanovich and Brown (1985), 19 C.C.C. (3d) 43 (Man. C.A.) 164

(c) Victim Participation in the Process **168**

Edna Erez, "Victim Participation in the Sentencing: Rhetoric and Reality" (1990), 18 Journal of Criminal Justice 19 168

Re Regina v. Antler (1982), 29 C.R. (3d) 283 (B.C.S.C.) 179

Regina v. Robinson (1983), 38 C.R. (3d) 255 (Ont. H.C.) 180

Criminal Code, s.735 182

Regina v. Curtis (1992), 69 C.C.C. (3d) 385 (N.B.C.A.) 183

(d) A Code of Evidence and Procedure **188**

An Act to Amend the Criminal Code (Sentencing) and Consequential Amendments (Bill C-41) 188

(e) Challenging the Traditional Paradigm: The Use of the Sentencing Circle in the Aboriginal Context **192**

Regina v. Moses (1992), 71 C.C.C. (3d) 347 (Yuk. Terr. Ct.) 193

Regina v. Morin (1995), 101 C.C.C. (3d) 124 (Sask. C.A.) 203